

[REDACTED]

From: Kerry Knights [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 1 February 2021 9:33 PM
To: Amy Selvaraj (DELWP)
Subject: Kalbar summary feedback
Attachments: Kalbar summary feedback.pdf

[REDACTED] [REDACTED]

EXTERNAL SENDER: Links and attachments may be unsafe.

<<...>>

Good evening, Amy

I have cross checked my Submission (831) with the Kalbar Summary, and find not all my points have been identified.

I have attached my feedback.

Please forward to the Panel Members. Many thanks.

Regards

Kerry Knights

31 Jan 21

Ms Amy Selvaraj

Senior Project Office

DWELP

Via email [REDACTED]

Good afternoon, Amy

I write following a review of my submission 831 and how that correlates to the EES Submission summary collated by Kalbar under Direction 26 (Tabled documents).

I was initially pleased to hear that Kalbar are mandated to read all submissions and summarize, but then not surprised, given their history, to note upon reading and cross checking that there were omissions and a general minimisations of submitter issues.

This letter outlines where the anomalies lie with my submission, and I ask you to forward this to the Panel Members. I suspect I'm not the only Submitter to find their comments and concerns have been apparently ignored on the summary.

To assist your team, I have cited the page number and paragraph on my submission as such Page/paragraph ie. 10/3 is page 10, paragraph 3

Reference number from Kalbar summary	An issue identified by me but not identified as such on the Kalbar summary	Minimised issue
2.1 GENERAL		
4		An extensive topic which is condensed to 19 words
10	13/6 "It's not what people signed up for when they chose to live in the area"	
12	13/6 "24/7 operations in the area will have profound and negative impacts at so many levels"	
21	4/8 "There's No business Plan" 5/1 "What evidence is there that Kalbar is able to finance the development and operation of the mine?"	
22	3/6 "The landscape around The Fingerboards is visually spectacular"	
2.2 BIODIVERSITY		
2	9/11 "The devastating drought ... and then bushfires ... are clear indicators of what is to come"	Drought of 2017 – 19 and then 2019-2020 bushfires not cited
4	13/3 "... considerable documented evidence around the effects of constant noise on the welfare of plants and animals"	

	13/6 "...Wildlife have no choice at all. They can't put ear plugs in, shut windows, or, as the noise consultant helpfully suggested, turn the ceiling fan on to block the noise. Creatures need to be able to hear danger approaching, bird chicks call to parents..."	
8	14/B "protecting this location to achieve a sustainable environment, one which provides food, water, habitat and more..."	
2.3 GROUND WATER		
3	10/5 "the full impacts of seepage and mounding haven't been incorporated..."	
2.4 WATER CATCHMENT		
2	10/2 "excess waters will be released in to the Mitchell River when flow levels are high"	
2.5 WATER SUPPLY		
2	10/1 "Calculations from the EES about their water usage needs would suggest this amount won't be adequate"	
2.7 AIR QUALITY		
1		Animals (domestic or wild) not mentioned in this overall summary from Kalbar
4	8/9 "Kalbar EES documents often lack depth, accuracy or validity. Measuring air quality at Traralgon (...site of a coal fired power station) some 120km away and using it as a baseline in rural Glenaladale is an example of distorting data to meet an end"	
5	10/1 "Calculations from the EES about their water usage needs would suggest this amount won't be adequate for their needs"	
7	12/1 "40m mine void, with the vortex of air picking up particles of crushed rock and minerals such as arsenic and silica, from the mine floor and walls, and carrying them out and downwind, until the particles settle with gravity"	
9	13/1 "increased noise, diesel pollution and grinding gears is not what is wanted"	
2.8 CLIMATE CHANGE		Changes to weather patterns not cited
1	13/1 "diesel pollution" 9/10 "Climate changes are upon us, and unless one still believes the Earth is Flat, there's no denying the Physics and other Sciences which endorse the Global Warming phenomena."	

3	2/9 "The Fingerboards also has ancient gums, which predate European Settlement, and are a visually spectacular source of carbon storage"	
2.9 NOISE		
1	13/3 "Noise will be a constant and the World Health Organisation is clear on the impacts this has on human health" 13/4 "... with sound at night generally expected to be of nature, or distant vehicles (sound really travels, especially when it's cold)"	
2	13/2 "Using a noise monitor with a battery life of 27 hrs and claiming it was able to provide 12 days of continuous monitoring has one wondering about the 'Chain of Custody' and what location the 'wiggly line' was actually monitoring"	
3	8/7 "... each disclaimer indicates intrinsic bias"	
2.11 TRAFFIC TRANSPORT		
2	12/7 "The proposed increase in traffic is just frightening. As a cyclist or driver"	
3	12/7 "The mine will transform this, brining increased congestion and risk of accident, along with frustrations and delays for road users as 80 Double B's trips a day have vehicles lumbering along the roads, which themselves are touted for removal and realignment."	
4	13/2 "The EES has no indicators for managing road accidents involving mine vehicles..."	
5	12/7 "The proposed increase in traffic is just frightening. As a cyclist or driver" 12/5 "No wonder 'The Fingerboards Loop' is such a valued cycling route, and part of Cycling Australi Road races. As well as local club events"	
2.12 HORT – AGRICULTURE		
3	11/4 "One only needs to look at the likes of the Strawberry Contamination Scare of recent times to understand that 'mud sticks', and the implications of potential contamination from one supplier has a profound ripple effect. No, actually not ripple, more like a tsunami ... brought the industry to its knees". 11/9 "If you value your vegies, like to drink coffee with milk ("latte, anyone?") and enjoy a good steak, giving Kalbar the go-ahead to mine will obliterate all the industries in East Gippsland that provide this. The dust will put an end to their economical viability as a farmer can't sell tainted produce."	
6	3/7 "It's not surprising that the Farm transitions from parent to adult child."	Succession planning not identified
10	11/2 "...will invariably lead to dust deposition on the landscape and industries downwind"	

2.13 CULTURAL HERITAGE		Secret Business not factored in.
1		Complex compound trauma not identified or acknowledged
2	3/6 "The Den of Nargan ... a Lyrebird was on the path in front of us, and stayed for some time, displaying its plume"	
2.14 SOCIO ECONOMIC		
9	12/6 "I understand the sense of 'solastalgia' that people would feel should the landscape be altered in a negative manner".	
11	3/7 "Or adult children return to the area to "be near Mum and Dad" and work the Land themselves".	
12	7/5 ".. there are other (abandoned) Mineral Sand Mines around Australia they could access and mine further 13/7 "Rare Earth Minerals are not as rare as Kalbars glossy brochures would have you think"	
2.15 HUMAN HEALTH		
1	2/1 "the sense of anxiety I, and all others, feel about having people who have never lived in the region, and maybe never visited for any length of time, having such influence when it comes to whether this Project goes ahead."	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder and potential for Kalbar to be subject to legal action around this
2	7/1 ".. it is of little surprise to hear muttered comments from the community about murderous intent should the Project go ahead". 8/11 "The reliance on desktop data by several Consultants had glaring ... errors". 12/6 ".. I understand the consequences, include increased depression rates and the real risk of heightened suicides. These farmers have registered firearms" 13/5 ".. the psychological and physiological effects are concerning."	A huge area of concern which is summarised and the number of submitters identified who raised this topic seems remarkably low.
6	11/5 "Looking at the data around increased respiratory illness adjacent to mining activities provides ample evidence of the physiological effects. Well before a Laboratory is accessed".	
8	4/1 "It provides the drinking water for Bairnsdale and surrounding areas, although many around Glenaladale rely on tank water only. The Water storage is some 3.5km downwind from the Project area".	
2.16 REHABILIT'N		
3	4/8 "Money, specifically a financial plan, is something the EES doesn't speak of. There's no Business Plan from	

	<p>Kalbar to demonstrate they meet the requirements Mineral Resources Sustainable Development Act 1990..”</p> <p>5/6 “Financially speaking, this (‘smoke and mirrors’) has included some creative and retrospective accounting practises which, in Sept 2020, mysteriously and magically altered the percentage of overseas control of the Company from 94% to 88%. Then, between 25 July and 24 Aug 2020, there was the issuing of 3.8 million shares without money changing hands, which resulted in the Company value increasing by \$5 million”. \56/1</p> <p>“What evidence is there that Kalbar is able to finance the development and operation of the Mine, including lodging a declared Rehabilitation Bond?”</p>	
2.17 COMM’TY ENGAGEMENT		<p>A common theme in many submissions and the details of this lack of respectful engagement is not addressed in the summary.</p>
3	<p>11/8 “And this is the level of ‘slap dash-ness’ which is meant to be acceptable and adequate to ‘give the keys’ to Kalbar to start mining this fragile, complex and important landscape. Surely not”.</p>	
2.20 TAILINGS		
3	<p>10/5 “The full impacts of Seepage and mounding haven’t been incorporated in to the risk profile and to consider risk of failure as low when TSF regularly fail across the globe in remarkable.”</p>	
2.21 TRACK RECORD AND EXPERIENCE		
3	<p>5/2 “What assurances are there that Kalbar, who have changed names and corporate identify twice already won’t do this again to negate their responsibilities later on.”</p>	
2.22 EES PROCESS		
8	<p>7/10 “And the community has no redress as Regulatory bodies are ineffective in their role. For a range of reasons, including conflict of interest (per the Auditory General Report Aug 2020)”</p>	

I could continue for considerable time with this document, but time constraints are such that I should conclude shortly. I am hopeful that it illustrates the standard of Kalbars summary.

It may be useful for Kalbar to go back over the submissions and re-read them. It is a lengthy process and I wonder if the person/s who collated the summary experienced a marked drop in their enthusiasm levels. This summary seems incredibly over simplified for the number and pages of submissions made.

One Submitter asked the Panel Members “don’t be numbed by repetition, but see it as widespread and genuine concern”.

I have read most of the Public Submissions, and fully expect themes to have been ‘lost’ in the process of summary.

As always, I ask ‘Whose needs are being met?’ and understand the Panel Members have read the Submissions themselves, and are not relying on the Kalbar summary to encapsulate all the perspectives, knowledge and concerns contained within.

Thank you for your time

Regards

Kerry Knights

